Lingue e Linguaggi Lingue Linguaggi 19 (2016), 287-303 ISSN 2239-0367, e-ISSN 2239-0359 DOI 10.1285/i22390359v19p287 http://siba-ese.unisalento.it, © 2016 Università del Salento

"THE WHOLE IS GREATER THAN THE SUM OF THE PARTS" Metaphors of inclusion and exclusion in the British and Italian Fascist discourse of the 1930s

CINZIA SPINZI Università degli Studi di Palermo

Abstract – The rationale behind this work lies in the current economic, political, and social turmoil and the crisis of modern democracies. Adopting a *Cognitive Linguistics* standpoint, the paper looks at metaphorical instantiations of nationalistic issues in the British and Italian Fascist press of the 1930s. More particularly, it explores what metaphors are employed in English and Italian to convey the notion of "totality" implied in the theory of totalitarianism. Furthermore, it investigates how metaphors contribute to the legitimation of inclusion and exclusion strategies which are at the basis of nationalism. Findings show the presence of universal conceptual framings across cultures such as PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS and NATIONS ARE LIVING ORGANISMS even though different lexicalizations were found due to cultural factors.

Keywords: fascism; frame; identity; metaphor; schema.

1. Setting the scene

The economic, political, and social unrest of the current times has brought about the rise of the so called populist parties in many European countries as well as beyond the ocean. On February 28th, 2016 during his campaign for presidency at the White House, the Republican Donald Trump twitted a famous quote used by Mussolini on June 20th, 1926 in Rome: "It is better to live one day as a lion than 100 years as a sheep" (Susmel 1957, p. 168). Once again *apropos* the newly elected American President, the Chancellor's Professor of Public Policy at the University of California, Robert Reich¹ has drawn parallels between the then runner to the White House and the early twentieth-century fascists by pointing out rhetorical analogies, such as the celebration of the national power and greatness of the American country in addition to the invectives against immigrants. In the light of the recent repercussions of populist parties against governments, the comprehension of the main features of populist political communication has never been more important (Aalberg *et al.* 2017, p. 4).

This contribution is part of a wider project on the cultural paradigms of totalitarian regimes from across Europe and the role of the right-wing press between the two world wars (Sinatra 2015). The project aims to study how the common European experience of fascism has contributed to the construction of the historical memory and contemporary identity. Thus, rhetoric, images, metaphors, and symbolisms from troubled pasts may be seen as legitimizing and explaining the contemporary social order. In other words, in times of crisis, the analysis of historical discourses – more particularly those based on traumatic events (e.g. fascism, wars, Holocaust) can contribute to better understand relations

¹ http://robertreich.org/post/140705539195 (Last accessed October 2016).



between nations and to facilitate the construction of more value-oriented identities. Comparisons of right-wing discourses, both at diachronic and synchronic level, may therefore help understand "continuities and discontinuities" (Wodak *et al.* 2013, p. 2) of fascist politics.

In this work we are looking at the discourse of British and Italian Fascism during the interwar years and the metaphors employed to construe nationalist narratives. We will be exploring the notion of "totalizing" as a Fascist trope from a conceptual perspective as it was expressed by Mussolini himself, who coined the term in the early 1920s by describing it as "All within the state, none outside the state, none against the state". In other words, an absolute belonging to a specific group that provided each member of the group with a firm group identity as well as many obligations, duties, and restrictions.

The media produced by the *British Union of Fascists* (henceforth, BUF), founded by Oswald Mosley, was seen as the locus for the dissemination of British fascist ideas. The metaphorical frames employed to describe "totality" in the English data will be then compared with those drawn from the less-known fascist Italian magazine, *Legioni e Falangi*.

In order to address our research questions, we draw upon the *Critical Discourse Analysis* (CDA, Fairclough 1995), and mainly *Systemic Functional Linguistics* (Halliday 1978), which becomes useful when it tries to identify the ideological significance of certain linguistic choices. The analysis is also grounded in the *Critical Metaphor Analysis* (Charteris-Black 2004) seen as part of the critically oriented approach to language study (Musolff 2013). The study of the framings used to construct British and Italian nationalistic discourses and their totalising slant may provide a thorough understanding of the British and Italian fascist cultures as well as of more recent populist rhetoric.

This paper is organized as follows. First, we will look at some peculiar traits of the British and Italian Fascist movement and their discourse. Section 3 will outline the theoretical background to this study while methodological tools and data will be provided in section 4. Section 5 will be devoted to the analysis and finally, we will draw conclusions in section 6. Results show the use of strategic organic metaphors, even though conventionalised, to convey the totalising slant of the movement showing cultural differences between English and Italian.

2. The discourse of Fascism across cultures

The bulk of literature on Fascism (Ben-Ghiat 2001; Gottlieb and Linehan 2004) sees the origins of this movement in Europe in the climate of economic and social turmoil after the World War I when, due to ideas of modernization and change, the main issues at stake became national identity and the future of Europe.

The analysis of the language used by the different right-wing movements across Europe started in the 1940s with the seminal work by Victor Klemperer (1947, 2000) and his philological analysis of how Nazi language embodied fascist ideology itself. Research on the repercussions of the right-wing rhetoric indeed demonstrate that some imagery (e.g. parasitism) still persist today and although they are "politically incorrect" they are not socially or legally relevant (Musolff 2013, p. 67). In her recent analysis of right-wing discourse Wodak (2015) has highlighted that the main foundation of this discourse is

² From www.britannica.com/topic/totalitarianism (Last accessed September 2016).



based on the ideological polarisation between endogenous and exogenous groups (Van Dijk 1998) in order to create a negative profile of the enemy that is strategically used to legitimate an extreme form of nationalism. As she argues (2015, p. 2), there is always some kind of ethnic minority used as scapegoat in order to construct that particular group as threatening the apparent homogeneity of the in-group. This gives rise to what she calls the "politics of fear" that is the result of the use of language devices such as metaphors, reductionist causal arguments, argument schemes to spread mistrust and fear of the enemy. "Fearmongering" was a prevalent feature of the 2016 US Presidential elections and also of the Brexit campaign in the UK (Spinzi and Manca, forthcoming).

Literature developed along the comparative line across English and Italian (Garau and Tilles 2011) has highlighted the need of de-centering Germany as a universal reference model for its peculiar anti-Semitic profile. What links instead Britain and Italy, despite the fact that in Britain Fascism never gained power, is the non-programmatic character of their respective anti-Semitic movements which have to be understood in their historical and national contextualisation. From a linguistic point of view, previous research on the language of the press of totalitarian movements, analysed from different perspectives, has shown the persistence of the argumentative schema we vs them, both in Legioni e Falangi (Sinatra 2015) and in the BUF press (Spinzi 2016), for persuasive purposes as well as for legitimating their political right. In the Italian magazine, England is one of the 'others', the eternal greedy enemy of Italy and Spain, the undisputed sinful queen of the sea, author of many crimes of history (Spinzi 2015).

This contribution follows the tradition of studies (Linehan 2004) which applies, in a less schematic way, the notion of totalitarianism as a tool for investigating vital aspects of the fascist ideology and experience. In this tradition BUF's fascism is connoted as a form of political religion whose spiritualism is of a different order with respect to the traditionally organised religion.

3. Metaphors

This study is informed by the *Critical Metaphor Analysis* (henceforth CMA, put forward by Charteris-Black 2004) that may be seen as an enrichment to *Critical Discourse Analysis* (henceforth CDA; Fairclough 1989) which is concerned with the way discourse negotiates social issues.

The validity of conceptual metaphors as basic cognitive and pragmatic devices which provide insights into opinions and ideas of people who use them and their way of viewing the world is by now commonly accepted. Metaphor constitutes a helpful language tool to the cross-cultural identification of "latent" ideologies expressed in language (Goatly 2007, p. 28) which have great impact on the lay public's emotions. Since the publication of Lakoff and Johnson's pioneering work in 1980, the conceptual significance of metaphors has been tested by the bulk of evidence in different fields of study which have contributed to shape the current cognitively-informed discourse approaches to metaphor, intended in terms of mappings between two conceptual domains or schemas (Musolff 2004). Metaphor is then held to perform crucial functions in natural discourse, thought, and communication. Culturally relevant frames and embodied experience are chosen in metaphors insofar as they activate links to other unfamiliar frames. This means that individuals' metaphorical thinking is closely tied to image-schemas that partly originate from our bodily experiences. These image-schemas are intended as mental codifications of experience, pre-linguistic cognitive structures or recurrent patterns (e.g.



"source-path-goal", "container", "part-whole" etc.) aiming at organizing our comprehension of the world (Johnson 1987, p. 29). Hence, image-schema metaphors are extremely productive in terms of structuring social events and everyday knowledge and account for which aspects have been foregrounded, "what inferences are facilitated, what evaluative and emotional associations triggered" (Semino 2008, p. 91). Furthermore, the choice of some metaphors in the place of others can have far-reaching ideological implications inasmuch as they disguise underlying social processes (Charteris-Black 2004, p. 7) and allow people to interpret more abstract meanings (i.e. emotions, power, etc.) through tangible representations.

A recent body of research has revealed the systematic use of the "Great Chain of Being" in those discourses (e.g. racist discourse) that tend to diabolize the others by "demoting" them from the human position to the lower ranks of animals, plants, disease-engendering organisms (Musolff 2010; Richardson and Wodak 2009). According to this approach, metaphors can be used to cast light on cultural differences. This work is placed in the post-Lakoffian tradition of studies which has refined the CMA by setting up relations with functional-systemic approach to the study of language and discourse (Semino 2008).

Persuasive discourses, like advertising and politics, are awash with image schema metaphors and some metaphors are systematic, meaning that "they concern not just lexical items but also whole areas of (popular) knowledge that are applied to the respective meaning "targets" (Musolff 2016, p. 12). A conceptual metaphor employed in political discourse which pertains to this study is PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS, mainly used to denigrate groups located at the fringe of society such as women, immigrants and homosexuals, and thus playing a prominent role in the interplay between the heteronormative and the marginal (López-Rodríguez 2009; Baider and Gesuato 2005).

4. Corpus and Methodology

The data for the analysis come from the collection of newspapers produced by Mosley and the sympathizers of his party. *The Blackshirt* was published as a monthly newspaper and covered the period from February 1933 to May 1939. It included the short-lived periodical, *The Fascist Week*, and after the publication of *Action* in 1936, a magazine-style journal, containing film and book reviews, it ceased to exist and left *Action* as the official organ for disseminating the fascist policy.³ Given the entity of this collection, for the purposes of this analysis, we are taking into account the first year of *The Blackshirt* and *the Fascist Week*, because they incorporate articles that introduce fascist ideas and propaganda and some articles from the 1936 and 1937 years for the anti-Semitic stance adopted by BUF press.

The Italian monthly magazine, Legioni e Falangi. Rivista d'Italia e di Spagna, was published for the first time in October 1940 for a total of 33 issues (for a detailed description of this magazine see Sinatra 2015). The magazine has strong but covert political implications showing the historical and ideological affinity between Italy and Spain and identifying their common enemies. The English and Italian data are comparable in terms of text typology (i.e. articles from newspapers dealing with current events but

³ The collection of newspapers is available at the following address: https://www.britishonlinearchives.co.uk/collection.php?cid=9781851171255 (Last accessed October 2016).



also replete with historical references); topics (i.e. Fascist theories and aims); and, finally, in terms of communicative function (i.e. propaganda). The only slight difference is the short time variance insofar as the publication of the BUF press production started seven years earlier with respect to *Legioni e Falangi* where Fascism and Falangism boast a longer history. Furthermore, the Italian magazine we are considering for extracting the Italian data has received very limited attention from scholars because it was very difficult to source and possibly due to the bilingual nature of the publication in Italian and in Spanish. In order to capture the "total" in the corpora, we considered five articles related to the theories of Fascism in Britain, which were published in successive issues under the title of "Fascism and Philosophy", and five articles with "enemies" (e.g. the Jews and the Bolsheviks) as main characters. Since headlines summarise the main events of the article and point to their newsworthiness (Bell 1991), it can be posited that they reflect the sociocultural values of the community; we find this to be sufficient motivation for the selection of the articles both in English and in Italian.

The steps for the analysis are those advanced by Fairclough (1995, p.6) and adopted by Charteris-Black (2004): identification, interpretation, and explanation. Identification implies a close reading of the data to determine potential candidate metaphors by looking at "incongruity or semantic tension – either at linguistic, pragmatic or cognitive levels – resulting from a shift in domain use" (Charteris-Black 2004, p. 35).

In the second step of the analysis, that is interpretation of the data, Halliday's systemic functional linguistics (1978) was espoused as theoretical model, in view of its stress on the correlation between form and function, particularly in relation to the three 'metafunctions' of language, viz. ideational, interpersonal and textual. The ideational metafunction is specifically relevant for our analysis of metaphors, in that it looks at the way language is used to represent the experience in the external world. Therefore, Transitivity is the system language relies on to construe meanings; it includes Participants involved in actions either of doings (Material Processes), or of beings (Relational Processes). If events are construed as perceptive deeds or states of fact, Mental Processes and Existential Processes, respectively, are at work. The elements that complete the Transitivity system are called Circumstances which encode the background where events occur in terms of space, time, role, manner and so on and so forth. Another functional tool relevant to this study is that of Grammatical Metaphor which implies an incongruent wording of reality at the level of the clause and thus a tension between grammar and semantics.

5. Analysis

This study follows from previous research (Spinzi 2016) where the analysis of the construction of identity and ideologies in the British fascist discourse has led to the identification of the dominant semantic macro-structure of war, set from the first page of the first issue of *The Blackshirt:* Fascism in Britain is introduced as a revolutionary creed suited to save the nation from the decadence and collapse of those times. Expectedly, the dominant frame was that of war in both corpora, in that it is mainly used "in relation to

⁴ Extracts from both corpora will be indicated by using the initial letter of the magazine (i.e. B for *the Blackshirt*), followed by the day, the month, the year and the page number.



conflict between individuals, groups, parties, and governments and oppositions" (Semino 2008, p. 100; see also Hart 2010).

The complex metaphorical apparatus which legitimates Fascism both in Italy and in Britain rests upon a semantic twist of source domains that immediately call back their semantic antonyms following a binary opposed argumentation scheme: thus, for curing the *cancer* of the nation/body, healing treatment/surgery is necessary to recover the healthy state (healthy vs. unhealthy); for *lethargy*, *depression*, *paralysis*, action is the antidote; *night*, *black* and *death* are in antonymic relationship with *daylight*, *white* and *life*; finally, *destruction* implies *rebuilding*. All these conceptual semantic domains concur to create the apocalyptic scenario at any level of the social life in order to legitimise "action" under "the light of the brilliant leadership and intelligence of its leader in Britain, Oswald Mosley" who "casts an illuminating radiance upon these dark currents of human history" (A/9/736/7). In the Italian magazine, moreover, this war frame is placed side by side with that of friendship (POLITICAL ALLIANCE IS FRIENDSHIP) raising a boundary wall between friends and enemies.

5.1. Organic metaphors at work in the English data

In an article from the first issue of the *Fascist Week* written by Mosley ("Revolution of the Nation") we read:

1) The essence of Fascism is <u>team-work</u>, the power to pull <u>together</u> and to sink individual interest in the <u>common</u> cause of the nation. These same qualities have been the essence of the British character in every great moment of its destiny. Fascism comes to Britain in an hour of decadence and of surrender, to evoke once more the great inspirations of the British spirit which have led through adversity to triumph in every great period of our history, and which shall not fail us now, in the supreme taut of the modem age. (FW/10/11/33/5).

The passage, apart from being an apology of British nationalism, explains its basic nature as aiming at cooperation inside the country. Like the faiths of the past, Mosley maintains that Fascism is common to all nations and that in Britain it will find its highest expression because it is more naturally adapted to the country. Union at world level can only rest upon the particular ability of each nation to live and prosper within the European system. This notion of the "total" is achieved in discourse through the analogy between the state and the body:

- 2) The Corporate State is built up on the analogy of the human <u>body</u>, which is composed of many millions of <u>cells</u> all working harmoniously together and constituting the human personality. The State is composed of many individuals who ought to be organised together to serve the State as the <u>cells of the body</u> are organised to serve the body. (FW/17/11/33/7).
- 3) The members of one industry, be they workers or employers, should combine together to carry out their function in society, as do the <u>cells of the human arm</u> combine together to carry out their function in the interest of the body.

The organic metaphor which is evident from the data derives from the cognitive schema NATION IS A BODY (Mussolf 2010). The association between the state and the human body is developed more at an inner level and involves the biological system according to a very complex argumentative structure of a complex syllogism. If the state is the body (made of millions of cells working harmoniously) and the myriad of cells corresponds to



individuals in society, thus the individuals should work like cells. The connotations mapped from the source biological domain of cells help represent individuals as organisms with their natural needs and functions, seen as being part of a more comprehensive organic unity. The emphasis is on the harmony given by the unity of the cells working together. The use of Relational Processes of the possessive type in example 2 (e.g. *is composed of*) helps convey the idea of individuals as components of the state and therefore at the service of the state, just like cells are crucial to the vital body functioning. In example 3, the writer extends the concept by meaning that the living organism is more than a mere aggregation of cells since it is integrated in the total system. The association in this case is between *workers* and *cells of the human arm;* the hand is in metonymic relationship with labour force, and as the cells of the arm work together for the functioning of the arm, so workers (metonymically represented by the arm) service the state.

Extract 4 is a further instantiation of Mosley's obsession with the concept of "wholeness", or in other words, the undivided unit found as the basis of Fascism in Britain and its tenet of corporatism. This example shows that the discourse develops following a scale which goes from the inner core of a living organism, the cell, to the atom, from atom to molecules until the agglomeration of individuals that constitute the state. Linguistically speaking, the choice of Relational Processes serves the purpose of identifying each element along the scale as having something more with respect to the previous one.

4) An atom is more than a mere system of circling electrons: a molecule more than a congregation of atoms: and, rising higher in the scale of existence, a man is clearly more than a communal system of body cells. Following out this scheme to a still higher plane, Smuts obviously suggests that the civilised state, as a " whole," must be something more than a mere collection of human individuals each working for his own hand. (B/16/5/33/1)

The metaphor is effective in that it allows the visualization of the deep-structure analogies between the atom and the civilised state: an atom is constituted by electrons that revolve around the nucleus and their existence is critical to the functioning of the life of this smaller matter. Put differently, what matters is the 'wholeness' of the whole that makes the civilised state greater than the combined individuality of its parts — the greatness is the key and not the size.

Furthermore, living organisms, starting from the cell, are living entities in the process of life made up by birth, evolution and death and thus they cannot avoid deterioration along time. It is here that the Mosleyites distance themselves from Splenger's fatalism that the Fascist theory is imbued with. As written in *the Blackshirt*: "Fascism, while accepting this conception of the civilized state, refuses to admit the 'predeterminism' that is the weakness of Spenglerism' (B/16/5/33/1). This is because the BUF members wanted to challenge the "inevitable, predetermined decay" of the western civilization by cultivating their virility.

Conceived like a whole where its constituent elements work harmoniously, the nation must be complete and healthy, cut off from any threat coming from outside, from what might destroy this balance or to use another metaphor in the data, this symphony. In the next section we shall move on to the metaphorical analysis of those groups seen as threatening the 'totalised' orchestration of the state.



5.2. "Those against the state"

If headlines provide the reader with "the optimal context for interpretation" (Dor 2003, p. 659) the headline of an article from *The Blackshirt*, "The 'Bee' in Bolshevism, Men with insect minds" (B/22/2/33/4) certainly goes even further by being unfavourably evaluative and linguistically creative at the same time. Contextualisation is necessary for a thorough understanding of this metaphor: criticism is being aimed at reforms on housing introduced by Bolshevism and the development of the new Soviet industrial city Magnetogorsk, seen as the emblem of Stalin's revolution, and ironically indexed in the article as the "promised paradise of the Proletariat". Following this housing scheme, adults were provided with tiny rooms or cells, and furnishing was stereotyped so as to avoid domestic ties and responsibilities; moreover, Communist teachers took care of children so that women, free from household obligations, could devote their energies to the service of the state. This novel housing scheme, divested of any decency, provides the writer with evidence to express disapproval of those who were behind the idea. The metaphor employed for this purpose is based on bees and ants as main characters:

1) The thinkers behind the Russian revolution, with all the boundless possibilities of human progress to urge them on, have been unable to rise above the mentality of the <u>bee-hive</u>. They see no deeper into the nature of things than <u>bees or ants</u>; their philosophy, so far from becoming uplifting, is merely <u>insectival</u>; their vision, which might have encompassed the universe, is bounded by the microscope – they have become men with the <u>minds of insects</u>.

In the example above the conceptual metaphor PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS is accessed through Attributes containing sometimes a Circumstantial element which perform both comparison and accompaniment functions: the thinkers behind the Russian revolution 'think' like bees and ants. Processes in which Participants are involved are for the most part of the Mental type worded in an incongruent way: thinkers see reality in the same way as bees and ants do. Thus, for example, the first sentence is construed as a Relational Process of the Attributive type (have been unable) and the two nominalised forms (thinkers; mentality of the bee-hive) are a metaphorical variant of what would be congruently realized as a clause. The nominal group the mentality of bee-hive is a metaphor per se, in that it connects the way the brain takes decision to that of a swarm of bees. In a fascinating study about the behaviour of these insects Selley (1991) compares the mechanism by which bees come to a decision with the way in which human neurons make decisions and reach consensus. Bees' behaviour is interesting not only at the level of the single insect, so individually, but also in a colony thus the collective level. It has been shown that the decision-making process considers many alternatives in parallel and the final possibility chosen is the one that surpasses a critical threshold. By introducing this metaphor, the writer sets up the instinctive limitation the Bolsheviks are unable to overcome.

Ants, which are located on their same semantic level as if they represented one single animal category with bees, reinforce the depiction of the mental behaviour based on instinct. The same functional language resources are employed to construe the world of the consciousness of the Bolsheviks. The other two Relational Processes (e.g. their philosophy is merely insectival; their vision is bounded by the microscope) are again Grammatical Metaphors or incongruent wordings of Mental Processes, inasmuch as philosophy stands for 'what they think' and vision may be glossed as 'what they see'. Again, the last sentence in the example 1), that is the Attribute with a Circumstance of Accompaniment (e.g. with the minds of insect) may be interpreted as the incongruent form



of a Mental Process (e.g. 'insects think like animals'). These nominalised forms are thus given as undisputable mental entities belonging to the Participant, the Senser, and mark the fact that the mental faculties of these people did not go further in their evolution process and remain at an instinctual level very far from the thinking process.

Bees are known for their creativity and industriousness and throughout the ages they have been associated to positive facts and stories. So for example, according to British folklore a bumblebee buzzing at the window announces the arrival of a visitor and the colour of the tail tells you the visitor's gender. Furthermore, in some parts of Britain, these insects are considered the messengers and the servants of God (Simpson and Roud 2000); finally, in the Bible (Judges XIV: 8), bees are praised for their hard-working characteristics. The connotations mapped from the source domain of bees are not related to the honey of life but to the traditional meaning of obedience and 'hard working' from which the phrase in language 'busy as a bee'. Industriousness is also a positive character of ants, whose main power lies in their teamwork. Each ant does its part to make the survival of the colony sure. Diligence, cooperation, self-sacrifice, energy are the connotative values attached to ants, their amazing ability to follow each other to look for their nest and for food.

The description of the disapproved type of housing in the article under investigation triggers strong emotions of refusal for a type of life where individuality is completely obscured in that he/she is one of the mass. In Fascism instead:

2) The foundations of world order rest secure upon the mind and character of the individual, and these revolutionary <u>insects</u> speak of "collectivism"; men must aspire, each according to his own inward guidance, and these <u>insect</u> minds think only in terms of the masses.

In this extract the *insects*/Bolsheviks are the Sayer of the Verbal Process *speak* and the Quoted *collectivism* verbalises what they *think*, namely their putting emphasis on collective rather than individual action due to the centralization of the political principle of social and economic control. The positive connotation of teamwork of these two animals is exploited here to struggle against the idea itself of collective intuition or mass initiative. Although teamwork is strongly praised as a value, nevertheless, unlike bees and ants, individuals are encouraged to emerge from the crowd through their courage and self-reliance since no progress has been perceptible when "these insects have progressed along such lines" (B/22/2/33/4). Nothing in history has indeed indicated that the fundamental principle of natural selection is ever likely to be reversed.

The metaphorical analogy with bees and ants remains at a superficial level in the text in that the mapped connotations are those of 'a very large number of insects moving together towards a precise direction' whereas the main connotation of unity and teamwork, which are very positive values in the British culture, can be put into practice if individuals decide to be driven by their "inner guidance". The appeal to the team spirit as a strongly marked characteristic of British nationalism becomes evident through this analogy with the intent of highlighting the individual as respecting the sovereignty of his or her mind.

The idea of a civilised state where everybody working for the good of society is protected from foreign interference can be found in an article entitled "Locusts of Humanity" by Robert Gordon-Canning (B/13/3/37/3). A very powerful metaphor pervades the text. The animal metaphor sparks reflections on the candidate for Shoreditch who was a Jew "flanked by immense fur-covered waddling figure" (*ibid.*):



3) Jews Jews Jews all-pervading. [...] They are only 350,000, so we are told, and yet by their *universal presence* they might be well over a million. Jew Conservatives, Jew Liberals, Jew Socialists. Only the British Union remains *uncontaminated* (emphasis added).

This description discloses the underlying concept of Jewish pervasiveness, meaning that they are everywhere and that they contaminate what they come into contact with. This quality of contamination (related to the organic view of life of Fascism) is deduced by inference from the statement that only the members of the movement are not infected. The concept of "large quantity" is in this article emphasised by the frequent occurrence of words such as *universal presence*, *horde*, *swarm*.

In another column from the same article entitled "Merciless Hordes", the writer introduces the simile between Jews and locusts:

4) The horde of locusts sweeping over the deserts, over the mountains; descending upon the fertile fields of civilisation, eating clean all the wealth, passing, leaving a desolation behind them, appeared at this moment an apt simile to me.

This analogy, which may be verbalised as JEWS ARE ANIMALS, is construed through a set of Material Processes (e.g. sweeping over; descending upon; eating; passing; leaving) that construct "a quantum of change in the flow of events as taking place through some input of energy" (Halliday and Matthiessen 2004, p. 179). The source of energy in our case is given by the horde of locusts, the non-human Actor that brings about the change that is destruction. The connotations mapped on the target domain (i.e. the Jews) refer to the features of these grasshoppers that travel in very large groups causing great destruction by eating crops. They are able to travel along the sea to reach other countries when hungry and – as said in the article – when they spread their wings they fly so closely that only a compact moving mass can be seen. This mass is so huge that it can "cover the sun and blight the fields" (ibid.).

In the Christian tradition, locusts appear in the Bible as a form of punishment from the Lord who, through Moses, asked Pharaoh to let the Hebrew people leave Egypt. Upon his refusal, God sent the locusts to persuade him to do what was necessary for the Jews and the apocalyptic and appalling description reads as follows: "They covered all the ground until it was black. They devoured all that was left after the hail – everything growing in the fields and the fruit on the trees. Nothing green remained on tree or plant in all the land of Egypt" (Exodus 10: 15).

A further entailment of this metaphor highlights the underlying concept of invasion: "They know no country, no frontier; exuding desolation, persistent, inhuman, rapacious" (*ibid.*). The meaning conveyed by this Mental Process of the cognitive type (e.g. *know*) concerns the knowledge of the locusts' behaviour: when they move they can go everywhere overcoming any frontier.

Against this backdrop, the ideological role and explanatory power that these images played in British Fascist discourse is unveiled. Indeed, this figurative description provides tools for legitimating the fascist criticism towards political institution: "It is often suggested that the lack of final success in the locust control is due to the inadequacy, or even absence, of control organisations in some countries which, therefore, *supply locusts to their unfortunate neighbours*" (B/13/3/37/3; emphasis added). It is worth noticing the strategic use of indirectness through the impersonal form *It is*, the irony and ambiguity of the evaluative message in its alluding to the inadequacy of institutions by letting the discourse develop along two levels, the real, literal level and the allusive, metaphorical one. The function of the locust metaphor is that of legitimating anti-Semitism but also of



pointing out the need of drawing the boundaries of a self-contained nation that is Britain by excluding foreign or alien people.

5.3. Metaphors in the Italian data

Pursuing the purpose of comparing metaphors across languages, the same target domains were investigated in the Italian magazine, viz. the notion of "total", the Bolsheviks and the Jews.

The organic metaphor employed in the English data to frame the notion of 'wholeness' was also found in the Italian magazine as expression of the schema NATION IS A BODY. Instantiations of this metaphor follow the strand of "body politic" theory (see Musolff 2008, p. 302) for which parts of the political entity are framed by reference to organs of the body. As we read in the Italian magazine, in the new order built up by Fascism, nations grow up in an organic way (un crescere organico), and together contribute to the construction of the new Europe; Europe, despite its age, is still giovanissima (very young), and it is and will always be the brain and the heart of the world. Furthermore, since nations are living organisms further metaphorical entailments are visible: living organisms may also have close relationships; the new Europe, indeed, receives energy from the friendship between Italy and Spain, from their solidarity or rather from their parentela organica (organic kin). This organic kin is based on geographical and historical factors: the two Mediterranean countries share the same Roman history ("un loro sostanziale contenuto romano che dà carattere naturale all'amicizia"; a substantial Roman content which gives a natural feature to their friendship L/F/1/41/8), share the same geographic position and common interests to keep the Mediterranean free from intrusi (intruders); furthermore, Spain and Italy are united by their revolutions which have led to 'the fusion of their blood' (e.g. l'onore di fondere il loro sangue/the honour of melting their blood). The semantics of the sentiment of affinity, of love, of solidarity and thus cooperation among European nations is so widespread that it leads to the fusion – the process in which the nuclei of atoms are joined – at any level, but above all spiritual. The notion of 'fusion' in totality becomes visible in the products of art, such as sculpture, where harmony is visible from the outside: "Nulla è indifferente nella totalità della forma e ogni punto visibile corrisponde a tutti i punti invisibili" (L/F/1/41/45) (everything is significant in the unity of (artistic) form and every visible point corresponds to every invisible points).

The other conceptual metaphor of PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS was found in the Italian data *apropos* the identification of marginal groups. The Bolsheviks are depicted as displaying bestial traits or irrational impulses but without likening them to any animal in particular. The metaphor in example 1 is construed through a nominalisation (e.g. bestiality) which is the Grammatical Metaphor of a Behavioural Process: the Bolshevik bestiality was aimed at the dead soldiers, whereas in example 2 it becomes a monster, a dark force able to destroy civilisation:

- 1) Ed erano letteralmente inchiodati al suolo, perché la <u>bestialità</u> bolscevica si era sfogata anche contro i loro cadaveri. (L/F/12/42/4)
- (They were literally stick to the ground, because their Bolshevik bestiality had targetted at the corpses).
- Il mostro bolscevico agonizza, e con esso scompaiono quelle forze tenebrose che avrebbero dovuto distruggere lo spirito, la civiltà, ogni forma di progresso e di ordine dell'Europa e del mondo. (L/F/11/41/36)
 - (The Bolshevik monster is dying, and along with him those dark forces that should have



destroyed the spirit, the civilisation, any form of progress and the order of Europe and of the world disappear).

In another article (L/F/8/41/9) the discourse about this enemy relies on the meta-discourse of geography used to speculate about the provenance of this *male* (evil): [...] *il male dilagava come una macchia d'olio, invadeva tutta la penisola* (evil was spreading as an oil stain, invading the whole peninsula"; L/F/7/42/8).

Bolshevism reinforces its negativity through the mapped connotations pertaining to wild animals that are given by very frequent adjectives such as ferino (ferine), primitive, primordiale (primordial), and istinto aggressivo (aggressive instinct). The discourse develops again following a binary opposition and becomes more 'organic': every man is seen as having a rational side based on experience that leads to balance and an opposite dark, irrational side, difficult to access. This ferine inner area is where the Bolshevik cell is found. As a consequence, rationality – represented by the European man – coincides with civilisation whereas irrationality represented by the Bolsheviks is, geographically speaking, where "la ferinità insorge e si costituisce a sistema, mentre la storia regredisce agli stati della preistoria" (bestiality arises and it constitutes a system, while history regresses to pre-history). The semantics of dehumanisation deprives the enemy – as the iournalist says – of any human traits or accent and depicts him as the quintessence of the brutality that we should get rid of. Interestingly, the localisation of the Bolsheviks in the eastern area of the world (accampato nella sterminata pianura russo-siberiana/camped in the immense Russian-Siberian plain) sets up a connection between Europe and civilisation on one hand, and Russia and barbarianism, on the other hand.

The metaphorical frame PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS in *Legioni e Falangi* was also found in relation to Jews as in the English data. In the long article "Corvi sull'America" (L/F/8/42/7), the journalist, talking about the political events that obliged the Jews to leave some European countries, underlines the avidity of these people by introducing the image of the raven, as the title says. The first lines provide access to the cognitive schema of likening people to animals through the verb *annidava* (to nest):

- 3) I convulsi avvenimenti della politica hanno messo in fuga la plutocrazia ebraica che si annidava nelle grandi metropoli europee.
 - (The fervent events of politics have led the Jew plutocracy nested on the big European metropolis to flee).

The metaphor is construed through the metonymy of the *hooked nose* which refers to the Jewish stereotype and introduced via a rhetorical question:

4) Quanti nasi adunchi già fiutano la loro preda nelle terre americane? (How many hooked noses are already smelling their prey in the American lands?)

The verb *fiutano* (they smell) is an example of Behavioural Process, a category which includes verbs sharing material and mental characteristics. This mixture is crucial to the interpretation of the metaphor which starts from the metonymic association between hooked noses and Jews. These people are like the ravens who physiologically smell to look for food; at the same time the mental features of the Process refer to these birds' ability to detect and then find "appropriate places" for their purposes. Both denotative and connotative meanings of the raven are crucial to the identification of the Jews. On the



denotative level, this animal is described⁵ as "a noisy, aggressive omnivore whose diet includes rodents, insects, grain, and birds' eggs". In winter, especially, it is a scavenger and feeds on carrion, dead fish, and garbage". On the connotative level, this rapacious animal is seen as "a near-universal symbol of dark prophecy – of death, pestilence, and disease". This resemblance between the Jews and the raven implies negativity from both the aesthetic and the ethical points of view in that it emphasizes "not only the ugliness of the Jew, but also his perfidiousness" (Oişteanu 2009, p. 41). Against this scenario, another rhetorical question aligns the reader with the writer's stance:

5) Quale paese sarà così incosciente da offrire le sue terre, la sua ricchezza e il suo potere alla voracità insaziabile di questo stridente volo di uccelli rapaci?

(What country will be so irresponsible as to offer its lands, its wealth, and its power to the insatiable voracity of this strident flight of birds?)

In the above example the metaphor is accessed through the post-modifier of a Circumstance of Destination which is the Goal of the Material Process. This seems to tie in with the primary claim of the article that highlights the greediness and innate ability of Jewish people to find profitable destinations around the world where to start their business at the expenses of others. In this case, the Jews are benefiting from the inexperience of the Americans who were 'generous' for hosting them. This gives the writer the opportunity to speculate on the reasons for the Jewish people's incapacity to settle down in a country. In line with the past-oriented Italian culture (see Hofstede 2004), the underlying values in the example above are those of the past traditions and the importance of history in the life of a community:

6) Forse l'origine dell'incapacità giudaica a concretarsi politicamente in uno Stato, proviene dalla mancanza assoluta di vitalità storica. Sembra una razza di ieri, senza radici nel passato e senza forza per volare verso l'avvenire. [...] Da qui anche la sua mancanza di volontà per radicarsi definitivamente in un territorio. Gli ebrei si sa, furono sempre vagabondi. Popolo senza radici e senza tradizione, che è come dire popolo senza storia. (Maybe the origin of the Jewish incapacity to become politically one State derives from the absolute lack of historic vitality. It seems to be a race belonging to the past, without roots in the past and unable to fly towards the future. [...] Hence, its lack of will to put down permanent roots in a country. The Jews, everybody knows, were always vagabond. Rootless people deprived of traditions, which is to say a people without history).

Again, the lexical items used here come from the source domain of animals like the verb *volano* (they fly) and serve the purpose of 'the animal scenario' instantiating better the 'invasion/reaching a place/flying' variable than other lexicalisations. Other two metaphors are used here in relation to the Jews: another animal metaphor and the water metaphor. In the first case the target domain is provided by the tapeworm and its connotative meaning of parasitism to refer to the ability of Jews to manage the American cinema production, the trade of jewels and precious materials, and the banking system without sharing them with other people, other countries or other cultures.

Although not pervasive, the 'water metaphor' is worth mentioning in that it relates to the concept of quantity that was found in both corpora. The 'water metaphor' concerns the association between the Jews and the river (popolo fiume che scorre fra gli altri popoli dividendoli con il suo corso tumultuoso/people-like-river that flows among the other people dividing them through its tumultuous flowing) and highlights the invading feature

⁵ From www.britannica.com (last accessed October 2016).



of these people that was also found in the English data through lemmas related to 'quantity'.

6. Discussion and conclusion

The aim of this paper was to examine the metaphorical representation of the notion of "totalising" in Fascist discourse. All the metaphors found in the data analysed – organic, animal, water – are obvious hyperboles. They aggrandise a notion – the "total" – which is *per se* out of proportion. Conceptualizations in terms of NATION IS A LIVING BODY and PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS were expected in the fascist discourse in both languages in that, if the former pertains to political discourse and is conventionalised across languages, the latter provides readers with a window on the identification process.

The topic of unity and harmony, one of the tropes of Fascism in Britain, the construction of a civilised state, the new order, have been framed in terms of organic life as primary source domain. The function of this metaphor which associates the functioning of a human cell to the idea of the state as a living body is that of highlighting cooperation and teamwork as one of the nationalistic features of the British people. More explicit and biological in the English data, formulated as analogies, both the image of the atom and that of the insects also serve the purpose of highlighting the hierarchical structure of society as put forward by Mosley. Both metaphors are strategic to the implementation of the political agenda. Nevertheless, the notion of totality is more naturally and organically constructed in the English data. Atoms, cells, molecules are functioning systems per se and their biological representation lends itself to the representation of locusts as contaminating factors. The use of biological metaphor for the depiction of the nation is also instrumental to the introduction of locust imagery in terms of the contamination of the body. Lack of control and fear underlie these metaphorical identifications. The potent locust metaphor was in fact also found in another study on the Brexit campaign (Spinzi and Manca, forthcoming) to refer to the uncertainty about events that nobody can control. The well-known biblical event comes to be standardized as indicating events man cannot foresee and manage.

The metaphor of bees and ants is used to denigrate people, in this case the Bolsheviks. As usually happens with animal metaphors, it has the ideological intent of excluding these people from society because they lack those mental skills which lead men to be different from insects. The choice of this metaphor has thus evolutionary implications and fits in the conception of the Great Chain of Being insofar as insects lack rationality, which is a property of humans, and particularly highlighted by the Fascists.

In the Italian data the organic metaphor is more physically connoted. The stress is on physical features rather than on organicity, on feelings and affinity, on harmony and fusion of emotions best epitomized by the statue as a work of art. Furthermore, the allusions to works of art (statue) and the description of the physical traits of ravens to depict the Jews are further examples of Italian aesthetic taste. The notion of fusion as forming totality through the "states=close friends" finds its source in the common historical background where Rome was the undisputable dominant ruling city.

Linguistically, these different views are construed via selection of different language devices in the "transitivity system". Mental Processes in the English data are auto-referential in the construction of the metaphor insofar as they are used to spell out the dichotomy between rationality and irrationality. Furthermore, where necessary, as in the case of the metaphor of the mentality of the bee-hive, language resources concur to



construct the mental environment. By contrast, the use of Behavioural Processes in the Italian data, when describing the ravens, is instrumental to the identification process based on physical traits and behaviour and supports the interpretation of the animal metaphors in behavioural terms.

Bionote: Cinzia Spinzi holds a PhD in *English for Specific Purposes* and a Master in *Translation Studies* from the University of Birmingham. She is researcher at the University of Palermo, where she teaches English Language and Translation. She is a member of the international research project called *Memità*, *Memorie e Identità*, *Linguistic and Cultural Heritage* carried out at the University of Palermo together with other foreign Universities. She is co-editor of *Cultus: the journal of intercultural mediation and communication*. Her research interests focus on Corpus Linguistics, political language and Intercultural Communication. Her publications include research articles in international journals, chapters in books and teaching resources for secondary schools. She has published two books on the language of diplomacy and two co-edited books on the topic of mediation: *Mediazione Linguistica e Interpretariato* (Bologna, Clueb) and *L'Interprete Giuridico* (Roma, Carocci).

Author's address: cinziagiacinta.spinzi@unipa.it



Riferimenti bibliografici

Aalberg T. and De Vreese C.H. 2017, *Introduction: Comprehending Populist Political Communication*, in Aalberg T., Esser F., Reinemann C., Stromback J. and De Vreese C. (eds.), *Populist Political Communication in Europe*, Routledge, London, pp. 3-11.

Baider F. and Gesuato S. 2005, *Masculinist metaphors, feminist research*, http://www.metaphorik.de/05/baidergesuato.html (12.10.2016).

Bell A. 1991, Language of News Media, Blackwell, Oxford.

Ben-Ghiat R. 2001, Fascist Modernities: Italy, 1922–1945, University of California Press, Berkeley CA.

Charteris-Black J. 2004, Corpus approaches to critical metaphor analysis. Basingstoke, Palgrave-Macmillan, London.

Dor D. 2003, On newspaper headlines as relevance optimizers, in "Journal of Pragmatics" 35 [5], pp. 695-721.

Evangelisti Allori P. 2005, Metaphors they Report by: The Construction of National Identity through Sports

Commentaries in Different Cultural Communities, in Cortese G. and Duszak A. (eds), Identity,

Community, Discourse. English in Intercultural Settings, Peter Lang, Bern.

Fairclough N. 1989, Language and Power, Longman, London.

Fairclough N. 1995, Critical Discourse Analysis: the critical study of language, Longman, London.

Garau S. and Tilles D. (eds.) 2011, Fascism and the Jews: Italy and Britain, Vallentine Mitchell, London.

Goatly A. 1997, Washing the Brain. Metaphor and Hidden Ideology, John Benjamins, Amsterdam.

Gottlieb J.V. and Linehan T. 2004, *The culture of Fascism. Visions of the far right in Britain*, I.B. Tauris, London/New York.

Hofstede G. 2001, *Culture's consequences: Comparing Values, Behaviours; Institutions; and Organizations across Nations* (2nd ed.), Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA.

Halliday M.A.K. 1978. Language as Social Semiotic, Edward Arnold, London.

Halliday M.A.K. and Matthiessen C. 2004, *An Introduction to Functional Grammar* (3rd ed.), Oxford University Press. Inc., New York.

Hart C. 2010, Critical Discourse and Cognitive Science: New Perspectives on Immigration Discourse, Palgrave, Basingstoke.

Hart C. 2016, Metaphor and Intertextuality in Media Framings of the (1984-1985) British Miner's Strike: A Multimodal Analysis, in "Discourse and Communication", Sage, London.

Johnson M. 1987, *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of meaning, Imagination, and Reason*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Klemperer V. 2000, *The Language of the Third Reich: LTI: Lingua Tertii Imperii, A Philologist's Notebook,* Athlone Press, London and New Brunswick.

Lakoff G. and Johnson M. 1980, Metaphors we live by, University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Linehan T. 2004, *The British union of fascists as a Totalitarian Movement and political religion*, in "Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions" 5 [3], pp. 397-418.

López-Rodríguez I. 2009, Of women, bitches, chickens and vixens: animal metaphors for women in English and Spanish, in "Cultura, Lenguaje y Representación/Culture, Language and Representation" 7 [7], pp. 77-100.

Musolff A. 2004, Metaphor and Political Discourse: Analogical Reasoning in Debates about Europe, Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Musolff A. 2008, *The embodiment of Europe. How do metaphors evolve?*, in Fran R., Dirven R. Ziemke T. and Bernardez E. (eds), *Body, Language and Mind. Volume 2: Sociocultural Situatedness*, Mouton de Gruyter, Berlin, pp. 201-226.

Musolff A. 2010, *Metaphor, Nation and the Holocaust: The Concept of the Body Politic,* Routledge, London/New York.

Musolff A. 2012, *The study of metaphor as part of critical discourse analysis*, in "Critical Discourse Analysis", 9 [3], pp. 301-310.

Musolff A. 2016, What can Metaphor Theory contribute to the study of political discourse? in Degani M., Frassi P. and Lorenzetti M.I. (eds.), The Language of Politics, Vol. 1, Cambridge Scholars Publishing, Newcastle upon Tyne, pp. 9-28.

Oișteanu A. 2009, Inventing the Jew: anti-Semitic stereotypes in Romanian and other Central-East European cultures, University of Nebraska, Nebraska.

Richardson J.E.J.E. and Wodak R. (eds.), 2009, Recontextualising fascist ideologies of the past: right-wing discourses on employment and nativism in Austria and the United Kingdom, in "Critical Discourse Studies" 6 [4], pp. 251-267.



"The whole is greater than the sum of the parts". Metaphors of inclusion and exclusion in the British and Italian Fascist discourse of the 1930s

- Selley D., Camazine S. and Sneyd J. 1991, *Collective decision-marking in honey bees: How colonies choose nectar sources*, in "Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology" 28, pp. 277-290.
- Semino E. 2008, Metaphor in Discourse, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Simpson J. and Roud S. 2000, A Dictionary of English Folklore, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Sinatra C. (ed.) 2015, Stampa e Regimi. Studi su Legioni e Falangi/Legiones y Falanges una rivista d'Italia e di Spagna, Peter Lang, Bern.
- Spinzi C. 2015, L'egemonia anglosassone nella rivista Legioni e Falangi. Costruzioni ideologiche e identitarie, in Sinatra C. (ed.), Stampa e Regimi. Studi su Legioni e Falangi/Legiones y Falanges una rivista d'Italia e di Spagna, Peter Lang, Bern, pp. 201-224.
- Spinzi C. 2016, The Fascist men vs. the Blunders of Politicians. Rappresentazione ideologiche e identitarie nella stampa britannica fascista degli anni trenta, in Prestigiacomo C. (a cura di), Identità, totalitarismi e stampa. Ricodifica linguistico-culturale dei media di regime, UnipaPress, Palermo, pp. 71-89
- Spinzi C. and Manca E. forthcoming, *Reading figurative images in the political discourse of the British press*, in "Textus".
- Susmel D. and Susmel E. (eds.) 1957, *Opera Omnia*, Edoardo and Duilio Susmel, vol. XXII, *Dall'attentato Zaniboni al discorso dell'Ascensione (5 novembre 1925 26 maggio 1927)*, La Fenice, Firenze.
- Tilles D. 2011 British Fascist Antisemitism and Jewish Responses, 1932-40, Bloomsbury, London.
- Van Dijk T.A. 1998, Ideology, Sage Publications Ltd., London.
- Wodak R. and Richardson J.E.J.E. (eds.) 2013, Analysing Fascist Discourse, Routledge, London.
- Wodak R. 2015, The politics of fear: what right-wing populist discourses mean, Sage Publication, London.

